| **Student Name:** Celine Shi |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house believes that student evaluations and feedback should be the sole criteria for retaining a teacher’s employment |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 5 to 6 minutes’ long.]  Good question in the hook, but it would be even better if you succinctly answered it yourself!  Nice job setting up the Opposition’s counterfactual!   * When we mentioned that there will be a diverse range of metrics, try to name what are these comparatively better metrics to decide a teacher’s employment on. * Rather than teaching style, try to point out that many of the harms that Prop is talking about such as excessive testing is often a decision made by the school, not the teacher!   + It’s not really clear why a difficult subject means that the teacher cannot be engaging in the lesson.     - We can then flip this rebuttal and explain that many teachers will focus on just fun and games to get higher ratings, rather than just teaching.   The set-up integrated the rebuttal and the countermodel, try to separate these two!   * We also have yet to rebut the following arguments:   + The problem of low-quality teaching in the status quo,   + Students being afraid to offer feedback in the Opposition’s world,   + Students gaining more autonomy in schools.   Try to avoid taking the POI right away as soon as it’s offered.  Good argument on students making poor decisions when it comes to teacher assessments!   * Focus on reasoning like the lack of maturity on the students’ part, rather than just a list of examples and maybe’s. * We’re missing the impact statement here! Why does it matter that teachers are treated unfairly? What happens to their quality of life? Will this deter people from joining this vocation?   Good second argument as well on how this lowers the quality of teaching.   * We need to explain a stakeholder analysis on what are the incentives of teachers, and why they only care about the student feedback system over all else. * We should explain the harm this does to the education system!!   Please offer more POIs in the debate!   * We had a lot more POIs in the last speech, try to keep it up throughout.   6.02 - Good timing! | | | | | | |